

June 25, 2019 [Updated from 5/31/19 version]

Assemblymember Cristina Garcia
Assembly District 58
Capitol Office, Room 2013
PO Box 942849, Sacramento, CA 94249-0058

Assemblymember Eduardo Garcia
Assembly District 56
Capitol Office, Room 4140
PO Box 942849, Sacramento, CA 94249-0056

Re: June 3rd Tropical Forest Standard Stakeholder Meeting

Dear Assemblymember Eduardo Garcia and Assemblymember Cristina Garcia:

On behalf of the undersigned organizations and individuals, we write to reiterate our opposition to the proposed California Tropical Forest Standard (TFS) that the California Air Resources Board (CARB) has considered adopting. We appreciate your efforts in convening stakeholders on this issue, including for June 3, 2019, but feel that further discussion about alternatives to TFS needs to occur.

Based on our decades of work with environmental justice communities, indigenous peoples in the tropics and California, and climate programs in-state and internationally, we believe that international tropical forest carbon offsets pose grave dangers for human rights and achieving greenhouse gas emission reductions. These offsets do not reduce emissions in California communities where massive polluting emissions occur. The March 27, 2019 proposed revision to the CARB's TFS proposal fails to address even a few of the many human rights and technical concerns that we raised through comment letters, at these stakeholder meetings, and at the November 2018 CARB hearing.

Furthermore, new research from the University of California at Berkeley, as referenced by the MIT Technology Review, shows that domestic forest offsets currently accepted by CARB may overstate their emissions reductions by *80 million tons* of carbon dioxide, which represents *one third* of the total cuts that the state's cap-and-trade program is supposed to achieve. We also agree with the May 5, 2019 letter by legislators to CARB and CalEPA outlining concerns with the environmental integrity of California's carbon offset program.

We respectfully request that the Joint Legislative Committee on Climate Change Policies exercise its statutory authority and convene an expert panel on the proposed TFS, as was promised to the public at the 11/16/19 CARB meeting when board members heard overwhelming concerns about international offsets. While we appreciate the stakeholder meetings that have been convened, we strongly believe that a formal and public process by the Joint Committee is warranted because (1) of the magnitude of the proposed standard and (2) the public relied on the CARB's representation that the Joint Committee would so convene and issue a recommendation. An expert panel focused on issues raised above that can protect against deforestation while upholding human rights and sovereignty of indigenous peoples

would be a prudent next step, upon which the Committee can better inform its recommendations. We **strongly** urge you to create space for these issues to be explored, particularly for the benefit of protecting local Environmental Justice and indigenous communities who would be most harmed by a failed climate program. **A Joint Committee hearing by leading legislators on climate policy that the public can attend and comment on will shine a broader light on this controversial climate scheme.**

Thank you for your consideration of our request. If you have questions or need additional information, please contact Mari Rose Taruc <marirose@caleja.org>.

Respectfully,

Zoë Cina-Sklar
Climate Justice Campaigner
Amazon Watch

Miya Yoshitani
Executive Director
Asian Pacific Environmental Network

David Gassman
Bay Area - System Change not Climate Change

Gary Hughes
California Policy Monitor
Biofuelwatch

Gladys Limón
Executive Director
California Environmental Justice Alliance

Brian Nowicki
California Climate Policy Director
Center for Biological Diversity

Pam Tau Lee
Board of Directors
Chinese Progressive Association

Cynthia Mellon
Climate Justice Policy Coordinator
Climate Justice Alliance

Darryl Molina Sarmiento

Executive Director
Communities for a Better Environment

Jeff Conant
Senior International Forests Program Manager
Friends of the Earth, U.S.

Anne Petermann
Executive Director
Global Justice Ecology Project on.

Jaron Browne
National Organizer
Grassroots Global Justice Alliance

Amy Moas, Ph.D.
Senior Forest Campaigner
Greenpeace USA

Pennie Opal Plant
Co-founder
Idle No More SF Bay

Tom BK Goldtooth
Executive Director
Indigenous Environmental Network

Ginger Cassady
Program Director
Rainforest Action Network

Lou-Anne Fauteck Makes-Makes, Ph.D.
Sacred America
California Indian, Shawnee and Virginia/Maryland Algonquian, Southeastern Sioux, Mohawk,
and Creek

Kathy McAfee
Sunflower Alliance

Osprey Orielle Lake
Executive Director
Women's Earth and Climate Action Network (WECAN) International

CC:

Assembly Speaker Rendon
Assemblymember Bloom
Assemblymember Burke
Assemblymember Kalra
Assemblymember Mayes
Assemblymember Gomez Reyes
Senate Pro Tem Atkins
Senator Hueso
Senator Monning
Senator Skinner
Senator Stern
Governor Newsom
CalEPA Secretary Blumenfeld
CARB Chair Nichols
CARB Executive Officer Corey
CARB Jason Gray