December 2, 2020

Re: EPA Administrator Appointment

To the Biden-Harris Transition Team:

We write to respectfully express our concerns with the candidacy of Mary Nichols for Administrator of the Environmental Protection Agency.

Given President-Elect Biden’s stated commitment to environmental justice, we would like to call to your attention Ms. Nichols’ bleak track record in addressing environmental racism. We encourage you to instead seek other candidates with demonstrated commitment to climate and environmental justice.

- Mary Nichols and the California Air Resources Board (CARB), under her leadership, have repeatedly disregarded the recommendations of the environmental justice bodies established to uphold the integrity of California’s environmental policies, especially as to how they harm or benefit low-income communities of color in the most polluted areas of the state.
  - The Environmental Justice Advisory Committee (EJAC) has convened since 2007 to guide the state’s climate Scoping Plan, which implements California’s Global Warming Solutions Act of 2006. The EJAC’s key recommendations were consistently disregarded and thus omitted from the final climate Scoping Plan.
  - EJAC members have expressed frustrations with Ms. Nichols’ contentious interactions with them, lack of understanding of the disproportionate burden of pollution on environmental justice communities, and her overall approach. She has repeatedly dismissed proposed solutions brought forward by community members who have worked on the underlying issues for many years, while at times displaying condescension.
  - The first EJAC process was so contentious under Ms. Nichols’ watch that many of the EJAC members resigned, some of whom then turned around to sue the state for its disregard of environmental justice impacts from the misguided climate plan that Ms. Nichols was pushing. The last two EJAC bodies called for the reconvening of the Adaptive Management Plan process that would study and address the localized impacts of industrial emissions increases, including co-pollutants, under the climate program. However, staff have not followed through, even when CARB Board members asked for these studies.
  - Similarly, in 2018, the Independent Emissions Market Advisory Committee (IEMAC), California’s official cap and trade oversight committee, warned that domestic forest carbon offsets, which represent the vast majority of offsets used in California, were deeply problematic and ineffective to meet California’s climate targets. The IEMAC and state legislators called for an independent review, but CARB denied them. A recent paper from the Center for Environmental Public Policy at the University of California at Berkeley bolsters IEMAC’s position.

- During Ms. Nichols’ tenure as Chair of CARB, she has staunchly pursued and defended carbon trading, while minimizing state policies that required direct emission reductions and other climate policy implementing programs that benefit environmental justice communities. As warned by environmental justice advocates, cap and trade has increased pollution hotspots for
communities of color in California, exacerbating pollution health and safety harms. The cap and trade program and other market mechanisms—which commodify the source of the climate crisis that most severely threatens global communities of color and low-income people—account for a modest reduction of greenhouse gas emissions and has not been successful in meeting California’s climate goals. Further, these modest cumulative reductions have not occurred uniformly. In fact, for over half of the regulated facilities in the state, localized emissions of greenhouse gases and toxic co-pollutants have actually gone up. Unsurprisingly, the increased pollution tends to be in communities with a 34 percent higher proportion of people of color, and 23 percent higher proportion of people living in poverty. Ms. Nichols and the CARB, in initially designing the carbon trading system, were fully aware of the disproportionate impacts that cap and trade would have on the health of low-income communities of color. Yet, they championed this strategy that perpetrated environmental racism.

● Further, under Ms. Nichols’ leadership, the CARB has designed its cap and trade program to include a significant share of carbon offsets. This further exacerbates pollution hotspots because offsets allow industries to continue to pollute fenceline communities by purchasing reductions out of state or from industries not currently regulated by the program. Carbon offsets have enabled California polluters, especially large oil refineries and dirty power plant operators, to emit an additional 200 million tons of greenhouse gases—again, disproportionately burdening communities of color with toxic co-pollutants. Even though many of these offsets are of dubious integrity, Ms. Nichols was also a proponent of expanding California’s program to allow for international offsets, which are even riskier. Dozens of environmental justice, Indigenous, environmental, forest and scientific groups and thousands of their members submitted letters over the last several years to Ms. Nichols and the CARB opposing California’s development of international offsets, but they ignored this swell of concern. In a November 2020 letter to Ms. Nichols, the environmental justice community called for the suspension of the offset program, especially since major users of offsets operate in the neighborhoods hit hardest by COVID-19, given residents’ respiratory health already compromised by cumulative impacts.

● Under Ms. Nichols’ leadership, the CARB has failed to be responsive to the needs and petitions of environmental justice communities in other numerous ways. For example, Ms. Nichols has failed to move CARB to exercise its powers over the state’s various air quality management districts. California has several air districts that do not meet Federal Air Quality Standards. California communities in the San Joaquin Valley and South Coast Air Basins are regularly in the top 10 most polluted cities in the Country. CARB continues to approve State Implementation Plans for these two districts, although the U.S. EPA disapproves portions of the plans. Communities hit hardest by air pollution depend on the air districts to fulfill their mandates on attainment of federal clean air standards, and yet CARB has not acted within its powers to press the air districts to act with full rigor.

● Ms. Nichols’ failure to address the needs of environmental justice communities is also exemplified by her failure to adequately oversee implementation of the AB 617 Community Air Protection Program. AB 617 requires the development of community emission reduction plans for communities across the state overburdened with some of the deadliest air pollution in the country. The primary goal of AB 617 is to reduce emissions beyond what is already otherwise required by law. Throughout the lifespan of the program, CEJA and other advocates have requested that CARB require concrete, quantifiable, and enforceable emission reduction
measures in order to meet the law’s promise. Instead, AB 617’s implementation has largely been centered on form rather than substance, and after three years, communities are mostly left with aspirational and vague reduction measures that do not go beyond what is already required. Despite a tremendous injection of state funds, under Ms. Nichols’ leadership the Community Air Protection Program has thus far denied the widespread relief from emissions communities desperately need.

- Finally, a few months ago CARB Black employees issued a grievance letter calling out systemic racism at CARB and outlining examples of discriminatory treatment against Black and other employees of color, including being subjected to disparaging remarks about environmental justice advocates. Cultural competence and racial equity values of any governmental agency leader are of utmost importance in setting organizational standards, expectations and practices.

These are some examples of how Mary Nichols has disregarded environmental justice, communities of color, and climate programs that benefit frontline communities. They regretfully show that she is not fit to lead an EPA that values environmental justice. Her inability to work well with environmental justice groups and leaders in California indicates that she is not the right person to oversee and implement climate and environmental programs for the country.

We respectfully urge your administration to seek and nominate a candidate for EPA Administrator with a proven track record of working with low-income and communities of color in advancing environmental justice solutions.

Sincerely,

Drew Hudson
Founder
198 methods

Kamita Gray
Chief Administrator
2Bridge Community Development Exchange

Mary Kay Benson
Steering Council Manager
350 Butte County

Daniel Chandler
Steering Committee
350 Humboldt

Nicole Kemeny
President
350 Silicon Valley

Karen Bearden
Coordinator
350 Triangle

Sherry Pollack
Vice President
350 Hawaii

Dineen O’Rourke
Campaign Manager
350 PDX

Miya Yoshitani
Executive Director
Asian Pacific Environmental Network

Tom Frantz*
President
Association of Irritated Residents

Andrea Leon-Grossmann
Climate Action Director
AZUL

Ellen E Barfield
Co-Founder & Coordinator
Baltimore chapter, Veterans For Peace

Roger Straw
Founder
Benicia Independent

Katherine Black
Steering Committee Chair
Benicians for a Safe & Healthy Community

Gary Hughes
California Policy Monitor
Biofuelwatch

Marj Plumb
Interim Executive Director
Breast Cancer Action

Jane Williams*
Executive Director
California Communities Against Toxics

RL Miller
Chair
California Democratic Party, environmental caucus

Gladys Limon
Executive Director
California Environmental Justice Alliance
Thomas Joseph
Co-Director
California Kitchen

Marie Venner
Co Chair
Call To Action CO

Mari Rose Taruc*
Co-Chair (former)
AB 32 Environmental Justice Advisory Committee

Penny Newman*
Member (former)
AB 32 Environmental Justice Advisory Committee

Marie Venner
Co-Chair
Catholic Network US

Nikki Reisch
Director, Climate & Energy
Center for International Environmental Law

Dan Ress
Staff Attorney
Center on Race, Poverty & the Environment

RL Miller
President
Climate Hawks Vote

Anthony Rogers-Wright
Policy Coordinator
Climate Justice Alliance

Alan Levine
Director
Coast Action Group

Felipe Aguirre
Coordinator
Comite Pro Uno

Greg Karras
Principal
Community Energy rSource

Sriram Madhusoodanan
U.S. Climate Director
Corporate Accountability

Nancy Rieser
Co-Founder
Crockett Rodeo United to Defend the Environment

Mary Crowe
Coordinator
E. C. O. Eastern Cherokee Organization

Mary Gutierrez
Director
Earth Action, Inc

Kellie Berns
Program Director
Earth Guardians

Lisa Montelongo
Member
Eastern Cherokee Organization

Leah Redwood
Action Coordinator
Extinction Rebellion SF Bay Area

Mitch Jones
Policy Director
Food & Water Watch

Michelle Chan
VP Programs
Friends of the Earth

Denise Patel
US Program Director
Global Alliance for Incinerator Alternatives

Theresa Church
Assistant Director
Global Justice Ecology Project

Bradley Angel
Executive Director
Greenaction for Health and Environmental Justice

Sara Shor
Organizing Director
GreenFaith

Caroline Henderson
Senior Climate Campaigner
Greenpeace USA

Isabella Zizi
Guidance Member
Idle No More SF Bay

Tom BK Goldtooth
Executive Director
Indigenous Environmental Network

Basav Sen
Climate Policy Director
Institute for Policy Studies Climate Policy Program

Maria Lopez
Deputy Director
Ironbound Community Corporation

Rachel Fazio
Associate Director
John Muir Project of Earth Island Institute

Kevin Hamilton
Co-Founder
Medical Advocates for Healthy Air

Sandy Naranjo
CA Organizing Manager
Mothers Out Front California

Pennie Opal Plant
Co-Founder
Movement Rights

Steven Norris
Vice-President
NC Alliance to Protect People and the Places We Live

Gail Evans
Attorney
New Mexico Environmental Law Center

Timothy Judson
Executive Director
Nuclear Information and Resource Service

Rebecca Apostol
U.S. Program Director
Oil Change US

Alexis Baden-Mayer
Political Director
Organic Consumers Association

Laura Haight
U.S. Policy Director
Partnership for Policy Integrity

Martha Arguello*
Executive Director
Physicians for Social Responsibility - Los Angeles

Antonio Díaz
Organizational Director
PODER

Natalia Soler
Community Organizer
Poder Latinx

Alan Minsky
Executive Director
Progressive Democrats of America
Ginger Cassady  Executive Director  Rainforest Action Network
Cheryl Barnds  Co-Chair  Rapid Shift Network
Donna Chavis  Founder  RedTailed Hawk Collective
David Braun  Director  Rootskeeper
Lou-Anne Makes-Marks  Director  Sacred America
Jack Eidt  Co-Founder  SoCal 350 Climate Action
Renee Millard-Chacon  Youth program coordinator  Spirit of the Sun
Shoshana Wechsler  Coordinator  Sunflower Alliance
Robin Schneider  Executive Director  Texas Campaign for the Environment
Laura Berry  Director of Research & Policy  The Climate Mobilization
Salote Soqo  Senior Partnership Officer  Unitarian Universalist Service Committee
Queen Zakia Shabazz  Founder/ Executive Director  Parents Against Lead & Other Environmental Hazards

* Former members of California Air Resources Board AB 32 Environmental Justice Advisory Committee